

2019

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission

Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, July 25, 2019

**Basement (Lower Level) Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701**

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:00 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Jim Sauer (Acting Chair), Jill Jenkins, Helen Erickson, and Jan Mulder

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Terry Majewski, Michael Becherer, and Sharon Chadwick

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Jodie Brown, and Maria Gayosso; Derek Hicks (University of Arizona, Student Intern); and Crystal Dillahunt (Ward 6).

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 7-11-19

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to approve the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 7-11-19, with corrections to the wording of the motion on case "RNA/DRB-19-11/HPZ-19-55 Indian Trading Post."

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/ Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

HPZ 18-92-Norgord Property- New single family residence [Continued Case]-526 S 9th Avenue-(Barrio Historico Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from PRS meeting of 6-17-19.

Project designer, Troy Williams, from TWW Designs presented the revisions requested from the previous review.

Subcommittee discussed the revisions as outlined in the LAR dated 6-17-19. The review focused on: lower the wall to 7' or less; garage gate to 6' or less; eliminate windows with faux shutters; change door into garage and gate with wrought iron and privacy screen; widen courtyard gate opening and return for a minor review with proposed wrought iron gate design. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented, noting that the opening above the front door of the existing building is to be filled in with adobe in order to restore the building to its historic condition.

4. Infill Incentive District/Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases
UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10

IID-19-01//HPZ-19-54 – Equilibrium Real Estate Investments (EQ): Rehabilitation/Adaptive Re-Use of bungalow styled Chambers House (Contributor to Barrio Libre Historic District). Review per Secretary of Interior's Guidelines; Demolish and replace an existing auto repair garage/shade structures and storage building with new multi-use development comprising of single family units and retail. Review for compatibility with adjacent historic structures – 18th & 28 West 18th Street- (Downtown Infill Incentive District)

Staff Taku and Gayosso provided an overview of the project, describing the project as an adaptive reuse of a historic resource and new construction of multi-family residential and commercial development. The Design Professional's comments were summarized.

Subcommittee commended the applicant for the treatment of the historic building. Concerns were raised about the massing and height of the new construction, including overall height, height of walls on 18th Street facade, and height, blank walls on 7th Avenue façade and proposed door style. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented, noting: (1) roof material for the restored existing building may be either asphalt shingles or corrugated metal; and (2) a craftsman-style front door is preferred for the restored existing building.

5. Warehouse Historic Review Cases

UDC Section 5.12.13

HPZ-19-56– Partners on Fourth Investments, LLC-Mixed-Use Development [Planned Area Development (PAD)]: multi-family residential new construction; retail stores; commercial development with a covered public parking spaces and varied building heights ranging from 30-feet (one-two stories) along 4th Avenue frontage to 140-feet tall (13-stories) towards the west (Stevens Avenue). The PAD will include key planning requirements notably sensitivity to the treatment of historic buildings and preservation policies and standards. 213-215 N 4th Avenue- (Warehouse Historic District).

Staff Taku summarized the project and stressed the importance of the project to the Warehouse Historic District. Staff noted that the project will be reviewed as directed in PAD 33 document.

Tom Warne presented the history of the project and the various uses. Dean Newins from OPUS GROUP presented the project design.

Per staff direction and in compliance with PAD 33 requirement, subcommittee discussion was limited to the 4th Avenue facade and the Stevens Avenue facade. The text of PAD 33 was not available at the meeting. Subcommittee was very concerned about creating a false sense of history along Stevens Avenue. With the historic wall to be demolished and a new wall to be constructed in a new location, the need to differentiate the new from the old is critical. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented, noting the following: (1) reuse of existing window and scone materials is encouraged on Stevens Avenue; (2) avoid creating a false sense of history on Stevens Avenue; and (3) include an opaque lower register on openings along 4th Avenue to reference lower sills on the historic building directly across 4th Avenue.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff updated on compliance reviews in West University and the Barrio and possible violations in the Barrio for addition of canales at Convent/17th Street and rooftop mechanical unit and new double door opening along the west elevation at 746 S Osborne Avenue.

d. Review Process Issues

None at this time.

7. Call to the Audience (Information Only)

John Burr spoke on Stevens Avenue wall as stated in PAD 33; mentioned Baffert Project meeting for 7-30-19.

Commissioner Erickson would like staff Beall to clarify for review purposes the relationship between PAD, Historic review, and Overlay Districts review.

8. Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next PRS meeting will be 8-8-19. Next full Commission meeting is 8-7-19.

9. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:49 P.M.